

## **Human Translation vs. Machine Translation in the Naguib Mahfouz's Novel Palace Walk: A Case Study**

**Mohammad Issa Mehawesh\***  
**m.mehawesh@jadara.edu.jo**

### **Abstract**

Literary translation is one of the most important ways to break down barriers between languages, as its mission is to convey the cultural aspects and beliefs of one people to another. For translating these works to look like the originals is not an easy task for humans, so imagine what would happen if they were given to machines! The researcher chose Naguib Mahfouz's novel Bayn Al-Qasrain 'Palace Walk' to study the differences between human and machine translation, so this study is based on comparing the results of human and machine translation of literary texts, in particular Naguib Mahfouz's novel Bayn Al-Qasrain 'Palace Walk', in addition to researching the strategies used by them. Finally, the researcher will shed light on the errors and problems faced by humans and machines in translating cultural expressions from Arabic into English.

**Keywords:** Human, Machine, Problems, Bayn Al-Qasrain 'Between the Two Palaces', Literary, Translation.

---

\* Faculty of Arts and Languages, Department of Translation, Jadara University.

Received: 29/12/2020.

Accepted: 25/1/2021.

©All copyrights reserved for Mutah University, Karak, Hashemite Kingdom of Jordan, 2023.

## الترجمة البشرية مقابل الترجمة الآلية في رواية نجيب محفوظ "بين القصرين": دراسة حالة

محمد عيسى مهاوش\*

### ملخص

تعد الترجمة الأدبية أحد أهم الطرق لكسر الحواجز بين اللغات، فمهمتها نقل الجوانب الثقافية ومعتقدات شعب لآخر. أن تبدو ترجمة هذه الأعمال كالأصلية ليست مهمة سهلة للبشر فتخيل ماذا سيحدث لو أنها أعطيت للألات! اختار الباحث رواية نجيب محفوظ "بين القصرين" لدراسة الاختلافات بين ترجمة البشر والآلة، لذلك هذه الدراسة قائمة على مقارنة نتائج ترجمة البشر والآلة للنصوص الأدبية وعلى وجه الخصوص رواية نجيب محفوظ (بين القصرين)، بالإضافة إلى البحث في الاستراتيجيات المستخدمة من قبلهما، وأخيرا سيسلط الباحث الضوء على الأخطاء والمشاكل التي واجهت البشر والآلات في ترجمة التعابير الثقافية من العربية إلى الإنجليزية.

**الكلمات المفتاحية:** البشر، الآلة، مشاكل، بين القصرين، الترجمة الأدبية.

\* كلية الآداب واللغات، قسم الترجمة، جامعة جدارا.

تاريخ تقديم البحث: 2020/12/29.

تاريخ قبول البحث: 2021/1/25 م.

© جميع حقوق النشر محفوظة لجامعة مؤتة، الكرك، المملكة الأردنية الهاشمية، 2023 م.

## **1. Introduction:**

Earlier translators and linguists believed that the idea of producing machine translation (henceforth, MT) could not be achieved at all since one could not deal with computers in natural language (henceforth, NL) such as English. Research and development of MT has been going on since the 1950s, engaging some of the best minds in computing, linguistics, and artificial intelligence. The dream of translation by computer is older than the high tech industry itself. Before email, before word processing, before command-line interfaces, machine translation, or MT, was one of the first two computer applications designed to act upon words instead of numbers (the other was code breaking), but it turns out that really good MT is so hard to pull off that the task exhausting the top-end computing resources of every generation attempting it. Today, all over the world, software designers, programmers, hardware engineers, neural-network experts, artificial intelligence (henceforth AI) specialists, linguists, and cognitive scientists are enlisted in the effort to teach computers how to port words and ideas from one language to another.

The real problem with today's computers is that they do not understand us when we use language. This has led AI researchers to work at developing computer systems which have the capability of understanding NL. NL systems are achieved with the aids of programming computer- language such as Lisp and Prolog which aim at providing computer- language systems that one can use by giving instructions in one's own native language.

Translation is one of the oldest means of communication between cultures and nations. Andre Lefevere (1992) states that translation that studies prosperity as a separate discipline is a success story of the 20th century, especially in the 1980s. Literary translation of fiction or any literary works, whether prose or verse, aims to deliver equivalent target text (henceforth, TT) that maintain the style, images, and characteristics of the source text (henceforth ST).

MT is commonly known as automated translation services according to Arnold Doug et al (2001). This new form of automatic translation emerged at the end of World War II. On the other hand, literary translation is a creative process of interpreting a cultural work into another language. Literary translation seeks to transfer the living characteristics into an equivalent in the target language (TL) and to present the cultural aspects of other nations. Delavenay Emile (1960) states that “literary translation, when it plays its proper role, serves to build a bridge between different cultures” (107). Therefore, can machine software replace professional

translators, especially in transferring literary works? And are machines able to build those bridges between different parts of the universe?

## **2. Review of Related Literature**

### **2.1 History of Machine Translation**

MT is a wide field of study that attracted the attention of many researchers in different parts of the world. Sager (1994) defines MT as "any process in which there is an element of automatic analysis of a source language text, transformation of this text and production of a target language text in another language" (326). According to Craciunescu et.al (2004), the evolution of inventing MT started in the Cold War which happened between the Soviet Union and the United States after World War II. MT was invented as a need to translate documents from English into Russian and vice versa. The idea of making automatic dictionaries appeared in the twentieth century to break down all the linguistic barriers. Hence, the American George Artsrouni and the Russian Petr Smirnov-Troyanskii were two researchers who worked independently to achieve this goal in the 1930s. Troyanskii was the first to propose a three stage automatic translation system: first an "editor" who is familiar with the source language, a second machine that can give a basic equivalent in the target language. and ,finally, a "second editor" who is familiar with the target language. Computer invention led to a series of attempts to use it in translation. In July 1949, Warren Weaver and Andrew D. were the first to discuss and talk about the possibility of using computers for translation before anyone knew what computer was capable of (Hutchins, 2001). Warren Weaver was the Director of the Natural Sciences Division of the Rockefeller Foundation and his memorandum was entitled "Translation". Rasha Okour (2008) states that Weaver's memorandum is considered the cornerstone of MT. Moreover, computer applications for translation were the idea of Weaver who was convinced that a computer with a good memory and high speed could be useful in translation process since it was effective in decoding unknown signs during World War II.

In 1954. cooperation between International Business Machines (IBM) and Georgetown University established the first demonstration. The scope of the demonstration was very limited and was based on 250 vocabularies, six grammar rules, and the outcomes were colloquial (Okour Rasha, 2008). From their side, Craciunescu et al (2004) point out that even though the project was bounded, it was as successful because it led to financial support from the USA and from the rest of the world. The first

versions of MT were based on detailed bilingual dictionaries and series of rules on word order. But, MT first version was criticized for using word-for-word translation, which is not the essence of translation.

After that, a lot of translators felt threatened for their jobs at that period. Suspicions surrounded MT system since the moment of inventing it. Holmström John Edwin (1951) mentions that:

Translation is an art; something which at every step involves a personal choice between unmodifiable alternatives; not merely direct substitutions of equated sets of symbols but choices of values dependent for their soundness on the whole antecedent education and personality of the translator (p.5).

Such comments have been repeated again and again by translators, so the need for evaluating MT systems emerged. In the next fifty years, the evolution of MT was slower than predicted and the results showed no sign of real progress (Hutchins, 2001). Researchers were convinced that high-quality MT would be possible within a few years.

Craciunescu et.al (2004) show how IBM and Washington University created an operating system called Mark II, but the results were truly disappointing. As a result of these unfortunate outcomes, USA government established the Automatic Language Processing Advisory Committee, known as ALPAC, in 1964. The famous ALPAC report was issued in 1966. The report was “highly critical” which claimed that “MT was slower, less accurate and twice as expensive as human translation” (Hutchins, 2001: 7). All of these characteristics were the opposite of the promoted ways of being easy, quick and cheap. Also, the report found that there is no need for more investment in MT. Alternatively, it recommended highlighting all the focus on “developing machine aids for translator” (Al-Otoum, 2006).

ALPAC report had a wide resonance that caused shutting many projects and withdrawal of the financial support of USA for over a decade (Hutchins, 2001). The report continues to be important until this day. However, researches on MT continued in Canada, France, and Germany (Somers, 2003). Hutchins (2001) states that in the 1970s it was accepted that MT works are better in domain-specific environments. The first success of this idea was Météo, who is a weather forecast translation system from French into English and used SYSTRAN. It is produced by Montreal University and has been in use since 1997 by the Canadian broadcasting services. In this period, they adopt the domain-specific use of

MT rather than general-purpose systems. Moreover, they figure out that it is better to design MT systems in specific circumstances with controlled language jargons.

Hutchins also points out that in the early 1990s a new workstation designed mainly for professional translators appeared. These workstations are computer-based translation tools. Full automated translation serves, MT, is known for being insufficient for professional translators because of the poor quality of the outputs. Translation tools give the professional translators access to dictionaries and terminological databanks, multilingual word processing, the management of glossaries and terminology resources and translation memory. These tools are known as CAT tools (Computer-Aided Translation). Sager (1994: 326) defines CAT tools as “a translation strategy whereby translation use computer programs to perform part of the process of translation”. Scott Bass (1999) points out that the primary benefit to computer-aided translation is still human translation. Hutchins (2001) points out that the sales of these tools, such as Trados, Star, and Atril, are increasing rapidly. At this point, languages were no longer viewed only as “static entity governed by fixed rules”, but they are now “dynamic corpus that changes according to the use and the users, evolving through time and adapting to social and cultural realities” (Craciunescu et al., 2004: 2).

The age of the Internet and the World Wide Web was the age of global telecommunications (Hutchins, 2001: 14). Hutchins also points out that this age witnessed the birth of the networking translation services. These network services are divided into two categories: services for the translation for large companies, and the online translations of short, informal texts.

## **2.2 Machine and Literary Translation**

John Cunnison Catford (1965) defines translation as “the replacement of textual material in one language (SL) by equivalent textual material in another language (TL)” (p. 20). In the case of literary translation, the operation becomes doubly complicated since, by definition, the two languages involve two cultures and two societies (Jacquemound, 1992). All different languages use literature to express emotions whether it is prose or verse. Generally, literary translation is more demanding and challenging than other types. So, the translator is always facing the task of conveying the meaning and conveying the beauty of expressions. Literary translation is a little bit complicated especially if the translator is not aware of the cultural differences. Delavenay (1960) states that:

The role of the translator is to establish between the two a zone of intercommunication bounded by the evocative value of words. Here we enter the domain of supra-semantic evocation, of subconscious association, of harmonics and the magic power of words. Are we bold enough to trespass with our machine into this sacred realm of the individual and the imponderable? (p. 107)

It goes without saying that there are always multiple options for translations of the same text based on the circumstances and requirements. MT is a mean to an end which cannot be perfect. These Internet systems are not translation at all — certainly not translation as traditionally conceived, as using the cultural and linguistic skills of a human translator. In a nutshell, despite of the effectiveness of translation tools in providing solutions in relation to different disciplines and text genres, the usability and reliability of such systems in terms of literary texts are still highly controversial. Many critics and educators still underestimate the usefulness of the machine translation systems in literature, which could be partially attributed to the unique nature of the language of the literary texts.

According to David Bellos (2012), taking literary translation as the sole object of translation studies skews all arguments about interlingual communication from the start. That is not what literary translation is about. Furthermore, he adds that works that are truly original, and therefore worth translating, statistical machine translation has not got a hope. Bellos thinks that Google Translate can provide stupendous services in many domains, but it is not set up to interpret or make readable work that is not routine, and it is unfair to ask it to try. After all, when it comes to the real challenges of literary translation, human beings have a hard time of it (Bellos, 2012).

### **2.3 The Novel**

Palace Walk (بين القصرين) is a novel by the Egyptian writer Naguib Mahfouz, and the first installment of Mahfouz's Cairo Trilogy. The novel was published in 1956 with the title Bayn Al-Qasrayn (lit. Between the Two Palaces), and it was translated into English in 1990. The setting of the novel is Cairo during and just after World War I.

Palace Walk is the first book of the Cairo Trilogy, set in Cairo, Egypt. It begins in 1917, during World War I, and ends in 1919, the year of the nationalist revolution.

The book's Arabic title is translated literally into 'between two palaces' — a phrase which highlights the cultural and political transition Egypt experienced at that time and developments brought into focus by the lives of the El-Gawad family.

### **3. Statement of the Problem**

Arabic language differs extremely in terms of its characters, morphology and diacritization from other languages. As Arabic and English are distant languages from two unrelated families, MT is bound to face many problems in producing meaningful coherent translations between these languages. When evaluating the output of MT, the transferred meaning is the most significant point of focus. Semantics in general is a very important aspect in translation theory and application and , thus, it requires maximum attention.

MT will inevitably involve problems arising from the automatic transfer of the message from Arabic into English. Therefore, the study will be concerned with the literary translation of humans and machines. Cultural background is an essence in the translation of any literary work. Thus, professional translators have to take the cultural aspect into consideration in order to convey natural equivalents; whereas, MT software is not programmed to take this important aspect into account. People who are not language specialists think MT outcomes are ready to use. The fact is that those outcomes are not suitable for the time being. MT faces many obstacles, like the complexities of grammar and word order, translating idiomatic expressions or cultural expressions and figures of speech, like simile and metaphor.

### **4. Objectives of the Study**

This study aims to examine and investigate HT and MT outcomes as an attempt to achieve the following goals:

- 1- Investigating whether there are any differences between MT and HT?
- 2-Showing to what extent MT conveys the meaning of emotive words in the novel?
3. Showing how both MT and HT reflect the flowery language figures of speech and emotions in literary texts.

### **5. Significance of the Study**

This is an original attempt of the researcher who believes that this study is important because it deals with a recent tool of translation which is MT. Since our world entered the globalization period, and people of



different languages need quick and cheap programs that can connect them with each other for free, the need for MT has increased drastically. The study seeks to illustrate the literary translation differences between MT and HT. At the same time, it tries to shed some light on the importance of human role, which will not be replaced soon by machines, especially in important fields, such as translation.

## 6. Methodology

### 6.1 Data Collection

The data of this study was collected from the first volume of “Cairo Trilogy”, “Palace Walk”, for Naguib Mahfouz, the Nobel Prizewinner Egyptian author. The researcher has selected this novel because it reflects the cultural, historical and political aspects of Egypt. Thus, the novel is a mirror that reflects the Arab culture represented by Ahmad Abdel Gawad family. The novel was translated by William Hutchins and Olive Kenny as a model for professional human translators. Google Translate will be the model of MT, which is one of the most used machine translation software. It is worth mentioning that the data of this study involves 20 examples collected from the novel "Palace Walk".

### 6.2. Data Analysis

The analysis of the study is based on comparing the results of the professional translators Hutchins and Kenny and, on the other hand, Google Translate. The study seeks to reveal similarities and differences of the TL in both of them and to investigate the strategies used. Furthermore, the selected data focuses mainly on figures of speech, such as irony, simile and metaphor, idioms, and religious expressions as an attempt to discover how HT and MT rendered these cultural expressions. Moreover, the output of such translations will be analyzed and evaluated in terms of syntax, semantics, and types of translation employed.

## 7. Discussion and Analysis

### Example One:

ST : لا دليل تظمنن إليه إلا إحساسها الباطني - كأنه عقرب ساعة واع (ص5).

HT: She had no evidence to rely on except her intuition, like a conscious clock hand (p. 1)

MT: There is no evidence to reassure him except her inner sense - as if he were a conscious hour.

The above example shows how HT transferred the Arabic simile (كأنه عقرب ساعة واع) into a natural equivalent (like a conscious clock hand). The translator of the novel used the naturalization strategy and cultural approximation to make the simile more fluent for the prospective audience. MT also provided an equivalent, but it is unnatural in the TL as a result of using the literal translation. There is also a contradiction in the pronouns (him and her) in MT outcomes. These two pronouns refer to the same person. Gender-based structures in English and Arabic are an expected problematic area for MT systems due to the differences between the two languages. The reference system of Arabic uses pronouns of two genders only; there is no neutral gender. This can result in translating some masculine pronouns in the singular, and feminine pronouns in the singular and plural that refer to inanimate into he/him/his and she/her, resulting in confusion and incoherence of the translation. The MT system needs to establish a relation between the pronoun and the noun to which it refers, and identify whether it is animate or not, so that a TL gender can be determined.

### Example Two:

ST: اتجهت المرأة الى المرآة فرأت منديل رأسها البني منكمشا متراجعا (ص.6)

HT: The woman headed for the mirror to look at herself. She noted that her brown scarf was wrinkled and pushed back (p. 1)

MT: The woman turned to the mirror and saw a handkerchief on her brown head, shrinking back.

In example 2 the word (منديل) was translated in the novel into (scarf). The MT is handkerchief. This word reflects a traditional custom that Muslim women have to wear. Human translator took the semantic and connotative aspects into consideration and provided a natural equivalent in the TL. On the other hand, MT interpreted this word into handkerchief, which has a different conceptual meaning that will create a misunderstanding of the function of (منديل). In Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary handkerchief is "a small piece of material or paper that you use for blowing your nose, etc." Moreover, in MT there is a syntactic issue in word order that created a non-equivalent meaning of (منديل رأسها البني). In the sentence, brown is an adjective that describes the color of her "scarf" not her "head". HT grasped the meaning, but the MT could not be a reason for the wrong word order. Word order errors occur when the translated words are in an order that makes no sense and this problem produces grammatically ill-formed sentences.

### Example Three:

ST: كم استيقظت على لفحات من أنفاسهم وما من مغيث إلا أن تتلو الفاتحة والصدمية (ص8).

HT: Time and again she was awakened by their warm breath..., her only defense was reciting the opening prayer of the Qur'an and sura one hundred and twelve from it (p. 3)

MT: How I woke up on the breath of their breath and no need to read Fatihah and steadfastness

In the above example, there are religious expressions which are categorized under the cultural expressions. Naguib Mahfouz's works are known for being influenced by the Islamic religion. HT transferred ( الفاتحة ( و الصدمية), which are considered Islamic expressions, by using the descriptive strategy to encounter the cultural gap and to eliminate any confusion that the audience may have. Transliteration is the most common error encountered during translation. Transliteration is the process of replacing words in the SL with their phonetic equivalent in the target language. Transliterating names from Arabic into English is not a trivial task due to the differences in their sounds and writing system. Also, there is no one-to-one correspondence between Arabic sounds and English sounds. In other words, HT resorts to paraphrasing which illuminates the meaning of the term. In the above example, MT transferred ( الفاتحة) by using transliteration into "Fatihah", which may be understandable for those who have a background of the Arabic culture. Furthermore, (الصدمية) that is also Quranic verses rendered by MT literally into "steadfastness". This literal translation failed to convey the meaning and provided mistranslation. To solve this problem, these can be included in the lexicon to have them transliterated instead of being translated.

### Example Four:

ST : كانت تحويهم بذراعيها وتغمرهم بأنفاس العطف وتحيطهم في اليقظة والمنام بدرع من السور والأحجية والرقا والتعاويذ (ص8).

HT: She would hold them tight, lavish affection on them, and surrounded them, whether awake or sleep, with a protective shield of Qur'an suras, amulets, charms, and incantations (p. 3)

MT: They were surrounded by their arms and immersed in the breath of compassion and surrounded by vigilance and dream with a shield of walls, veils, riba, and camels.

In this example, ST contains a visual description that reflects the cultural ways of protection used by some Muslims. These ways are inspired by Islam and the Arab myth. HT conveyed the ST into a fluent equivalent in TL. On the other hand, MT semantic choices failed to render any equivalents for their conceptual meanings. MT transferred these ways by using the literal translation which is considered unnatural for the audience. For instance, (السور) decoded in HT into "suras", thereby HT used transliteration because the concept does not exist in the TL. In contrast, MT rendered it literally into "walls", which is irrelevant as well to ST, as the word "camels". MT cannot recognize homographs. Homographs are words that have the same spelling but they differ in meaning. As a result, the word (السور) is translated into "walls". Such errors, as said, can occur when a single word can have different senses according to the context in which the word is used, but they also occur due to the diacritization in Arabic language. Arabic involves diacritization of vowels, which is largely ignored in modern syntax.

#### Example Five:

ST: (ص.11) استودعكم الله

HT: May God keep you (p.6)

MT: God save you

In the ST of the above example (استودعكم الله) is an expression that is used by some Muslims at the end of conversations. HT and MT used the literal translation to convey it. But, both interpretations of this expression sound unnatural for the TL readers. The researcher recommends using domestication strategy to give an alternative translation, which simply could be "goodbye".

#### Example Six:

ST : بدا في وقفته طويل القامة عريض المنكبين ضخم الجسد ذا كرش كبير مكتنزة  
اشتملت عليها جميعاً جبة و ققطان (ص. 13)

HT: He looked tall and broad-shouldered standing there. He had a massive body with a large, firm belly, covered smartly and comfortable by a cloak and a caftan (p. 8)

MT: He appeared in his tall standing, huge shoulders, huge body with a large chunky crunch, all of which included a meal and caftans.

In the ST, there is visual imagery that is conveyed precisely in the HT. The aim of imagery is to arouse the imagination in the minds of readers. HT took the specific cultural expressions (جبة و قفطان) into account. The word (قفطان) translated by transliteration strategy into “caftan”, because it has no equivalent in TL. The translator borrows the word "caftan" from Turkish Language. The other word (جبة) is translated functionally by naturalization strategy and cultural approximation into “cloak”, although it does not refer to the same outfit. Alternatively, in MT outcomes, there is a repetition of the word “huge”, which is in MT the interpretation of (كبير) and (ضخم). There is also an expected mistake in interpreting the expression (جبة), because it has no actual equivalent in the TL, so MT did not give natural meaning. As a matter of fact, “meal” is totally unrelated to the denotative or connotative meaning of (الجبة).

### Example Seven:

ST: (25 .ص) سامع يا ابن الكلب!

HT: Hear that, you son of a bitch (p. 20)

MT: Hear, O son of the dog!

In the ST, the expression (ابن الكلب) is used to reflect the tone of anger. HT transferred this attitude into equivalent by using cultural approximation and naturalization, while MT transferred it into “dog” which is a literal translation. It mistranslated of the connotative concept of this expression. The relationship between man and animals is based on various aspects such as history, culture, and religion. Dogs are, like many animals, treated differently from one culture to another. For instance, in the Western culture dogs are beloved pets and considered as members of the family, whereas in Islamic culture, they are considered dirty. For this reason, MT outcomes did not have the same effect on the TL readers.

### Example Eight:

ST: (153 .ص) من شابه أباه فما ظلم

HT: There’s nothing wrong with a kid who takes after his old man (p. 130)

MT: Like Father, Like Son

Each culture has its own traditional way to express the wise saying which reflects the customs and traditions of people in a simple matter. These traditional sayings are known as proverbs. Translating proverbs is not an easy task for humans as well as for machines. The ST in the novel is full of proverbs as they add beauty to the text. MT of this proverb gives a

cultural substitute which is considered a natural equivalent. On the other hand, HT transferred it by using the descriptive strategy, which is not required because there is an equivalent proverb in the TL. MT provided a more natural equivalent, so, in this case MT outcomes are better than HT.

### Example Nine:

ST: (296) ذاك الشبل من هذا الأسد (ص. 296)

HT: He's this lion's cub (p. 256)

MT: That cub from this lion

In the above translation, both HT and MT used the literal translation which is regarded as unnatural for the audience. The researcher recommends the following translation that is considered a natural idiom equivalent in the TL: "chip off the old block".

### Example Ten:

ST: (33) أمسكا بالله و اجلسا لناكل فطورنا بسلام (ص. 33)

HT: Trust in God. Sit down. Let's eat our breakfast in peace (p. 26)

MT: Hold on to God and sit to eat our breakfast safely

As stated earlier, this fictional literary work is loaded with religious expressions that convey the beliefs and cultural point of view of Arabs, especially Egyptians. HT and MT used the literal translation of the expression (أمسكا بالله). Both interpretations are considered unnatural for the target readers. Moreover, MT made an error in translating the word (سلام); into "safely". The researcher recommends the following translation for (أمسكا بالله), which seems more natural for the TL audience: "keep calm" or "calm down".

### Example Eleven:

ST: (194) الفاتحة أمانة (ص. 194)

HT: Reciting the opening prayer of the Qur'an will protect you. (p.166)

MT: Fatihah Amanah

In the above example, ST contains a religious expression "الفاتحة أمانة". HT used the descriptive strategy again because of the cultural gap that exists between Arabic and English. The translator added information for the sake of elaboration for readers. HT omitted (أمانة), because this expression has no equivalent in the TL. On the other hand, MT transferred

the text by transliteration, which may seem vague for target readers, especially “Amanah” that has a connotative meaning related to religion. The suggested translation for "Amanah" is "promise me to recite the opening prayer".

### Example Twelve:

ST : نجا كمال من عصى الفتوات و لكنه كان كالمستجير من الرمضاء بالنار، لأن عصا أبيه فعلت بقدميه ما لم تكن لتفعله عشرات العصى (ص 55).

HT: Kamal escaped from the sticks of the toughs, but it was like jumping out of the pan into the fire. His father's stick did more to his feet than tens of others would have (p. 46)

MT: Kamal escaped from the sticks of the young men, but he was like a firefighter, who smelt with fire because his father's stick had done with his feet unless he had done dozens of sticks.

In the above example, there is a cultural expression (الفتوات). HT rendered the function of this expression into “toughs”, which is a natural equivalent. Therefore, HT used the cultural approximation to convey the meaning. MT translated it into “young men” which does not convey the connotative meaning of this expression. There is also an idiomatic expression in ST that should be translated into an equivalent idiom in the TL, which is (كالمستجير من الرمضاء بالنار). HT translated it by using the functional equivalence into “jumping out of the pan into the fire”. This translation is considered a natural and suitable substitute of the idiom. However, MT translated it into “like a firefighter, who smelt with fire” that led to mistranslation.

### Example Thirteen:

ST: لكن الشاب والغلام مضيا إلى شطر السطح الآخر حيث لا يحجب فلول النور حجاب (ص 68).

HT: The young man and the boy went to the far side of the roof where nothing barred the sun's last rays (p. 58)

MT: But the young man and the boy go to the other part of the surface where the remnants of the light do not veil the veil

The above example is full of images which seek to link the reader mind to the literary work. The translation of the images should arouse the imagination of the target readers and affect them in the same way ST does. HT succeeded in achieving the functional equivalent, while MT semantic choices did not transfer this image to the readers. In MT, (حجاب) was

translated literally into (veil), so it conveyed the denotative meaning and did not take the connotative meaning into consideration.

Example Fourteen:

ST: ابتعدت عنه وهي تدعو لفتاها بالفلاح وطول العمر ثم عبرت الصالة الى الدهليز

الخارجي (ص.80)

HT: She closed the door and crossed the sitting room to the outer hall (p. 69)

MT: She moved away from him, calling her to the peasant and the longevity, and then crossed the hall to the outer vestibule.

In the above example, the translator resorted to omission strategy through which certain parts of the target can be ignored. This technique is used for different reasons: (a) the item might be untranslatable for lack of equivalence in the TL, (b) the item might be ideologically or morally unacceptable by the target readers, and (c) the translator might be in disagreement with the meaning which conveys a bad impression about the source culture. According to Ivacovoni (2009), "Omission means dropping a word or words from the SLT while translating" (p.1). This procedure can be the outcome of the cultural clashes that exist between the SL and the TL. The translator omits words that do not have equivalents in the TT. HT used this strategy; the translator omitted the expression " تدعو لفتاها بالفلاح وطول العمر", because this expression is related to the cultural and religious aspect that does not exist in the TT. MT rendered the mentioned expression literally without conveying the intended meaning. Neither the translator nor the machine succeeded in conveying the emotive expression.

**Example Fifteen:**

ST: ساعة لربك و ساعة لقلبك (ص. 287)

HT: There's an hour for your Lord and an hour for your heart (p. 284)

MT: An hour for your Lord and an hour for your heart.

In the above example, both HT and MT used the literal translation that may be unnatural for the audience. This strategy, literal translation, only conveys the denotative or the basic meaning of the words. The translation of literary works should affect the target readers in the same way the ST affected the source readers. As a result, the researcher recommends the following substitute which is considered a natural equivalent proverb in English: "All work and no play make Jack a dull boy".



### **Example Sixteen:**

ST: (529) نالت الجزاء الذي تستحقه، فلينقعها أبوها و يشرب ماءها (ص. 529)

HT: She got what she deserves. Let her father brew her up and drink her down (p. 457)

MT: She received the penalty she deserves, so her father will take her and drink her water.

The underlined expression is an example of a proverb that is usually used in situations of describing something useless by Arabs. This proverbial expression is said as a manifestation of carelessness or a sort of negative response. HT rendered this expression by using the functional equivalent, but it is not natural for the receptor audience. MT also conveyed it by using the literal translation. Literal translation provided an odd equivalent that will not be understandable for the audience. The researcher recommends the following translation: “I don’t care about her anymore”.

### **Example Seventeen:**

ST: (104) بسم الله الرحمن الرحيم... أنت! (ص. 104)

HT: In the name of God, the Compassionate, the Merciful!... You! (p.92)

MT: In the name of God the Merciful ... You!

In the above example, there is a religious expression again. HT interpreted it by using the literal translation, so did the MT. In the novel, this expression is said by Madam Zubayda when she was surprised to see Al-Sayyid Ahmad. Therefore, the translation should reflect the situation and affect the TL audience as it did to the SL audience. But the literal translation missed the whole point of view of this expression. The researcher suggested the following translation “Oh my God! You!”

### **Example Eighteen:**

ST: (106) أخاف أن أنقض وضوئي (ص. 106)

HT: I’m afraid I would have to repeat my ritual ablutions (p. 93)

MT: I am afraid that I will break my light

According to Mehawesh and Sadeq (2014), the terms which deal with the religious aspects of a culture are usually the most difficult, both in analysis of the source vocabulary and in finding the best receptor language equivalence. The reason is that these words are intangible and many of the

practices are so automatic that the speakers of the language are not as conscious of the various aspects of meaning involved. Therefore, the translator will encounter much difficulty in translating expressions which are not used or practiced in the TL.

The ST in the above example contains cultural expressions derived from the Islamic religion. The expression (أنقض وضوئي) is interpreted into "to repeat my ritual ablutions". The religious sense of this expression is totally missing in the TL. Thus, the translator described the term in order to convey the intended meaning. MT, on the other hand, failed in translating the above expression, especially (وضوئي) that is interpreted in a very literal way into "light".

Example Nineteen:

ST: (ص.217) يا نهارنا الأسود

HT: What an unlucky day for us! (p.185)

MT: O our black day

Expressions related to idiomatic colors are different from one culture to another. Each language has its own specific way of representing such idioms. Black color in the Arab culture and heritage is linked to bad luck and evil and usually evokes sadness. According to Salim and Mehawesh (2013), black color has negative associations, such as sadness, remorse, anger, fear, evil, anonymity, unhappiness. In western cultures, this is the color of mourning and death. In Arabic, black is associated with evil.

In the context, black color (الأسود) stands for bad luck. HT used the cultural approximation strategy to convey a natural equivalent, whereas MT used literal translation to transfer it. MT mistranslated the meaning of this idiom because idioms should not be interpreted literally.

Example Twenty:

ST: رمى السيد خديجة بنظرة حمراء و صاح بها:

لماذا؟ (ص. 262)

HT: Al-Sayyid Ahmad threw Khadija a fiery look and shouted at her,

Why? (p.225)

MT: Mr. Khadija threw a red look and shouted:

Why?

According to Salim and Mehawesh (2013), "Red" (احمر) may have negative connotations such as anger, shame, and aggression in Arabic. Furthermore, it is a symbol of blood and red rose. The connection between red and blood is due to the physical manifestation of blood causing the face to flush in emotional arousal. In addition, Arabic speakers say "show the red eye" for being strict with someone or warning and threatening and "see the world red" which means anger.

This example illustrates how both HT and MT transferred color idiomatic expressions. HT used cultural approximation again to transfer the connotative meaning of this color: "red", which is "anger". On the other hand, MT failed again in conveying the intended meaning from "red look".

## **8. Conclusion**

This paper has been an attempt to draw a distinction between MT (Google Translate) and HT of Naguib Mahfouz novel Palace Walk, shedding light on the different characteristics of both of them. The focus has been on depicting some of the factors that render HT more effective and flexible in comparison to MT. The paper also highlighted some strategies used by HT and the errors made by MT.

The present study is a knob in the range of MT research in general and Google Translate research in particular. It tackles language errors in translating from Arabic into English, which represents one face of the coin. More focused research on every type of language errors by itself may set up an important database for Google Translate program developers. Further research is needed to address contrastive linguistics issues, comparing Google Translate performance in translating the texts into other language. Besides, the research that investigates the reasons behind the limitations of Google Translate will contribute significantly to the software improvement.

## References:

- Acquemond, R & Tresilian, D. (2008). *Conscience of the nation: writers, state, and society in modern Egypt*. Cairo, Egypt, American University in Cairo Press.
- Al-Otoun, N. (2006). *An Evaluation of Two Arabic-into-English Machine Translation Systems: A Comparative Study*. Unpublished Master Thesis. Yarmouk University.
- Arnold, D. et al., (2001) *Machine Translation: An Introductory Guide*. London: NCC Blackwell.
- Bass, S. (1999). *Machine vs. Human Translation*. Advanced Language Translation. INC.
- Bellos, D. (2012). *Is that a fish in your ear?: Translation and the meaning of everything*. London: Particular Books.
- Catford, J. (1965). *A linguistic theory of translation*. London: Oxford University Press.
- Craciunescu, O. et al., (2004) *Machine Translation and Computer-Assisted Translation: A New Way of Translating*. *Translation Journal*. 18(3),
- Delavenay, E. (1960). *An Introduction to Machine Translation*. London: Thames and Hudson. <http://www.mt-archive.info/50/Delavenay-1960.pdf>
- Holmström, E. (1951). *Report on interlingual scientific and technical dictionaries*. Paris: Unesco.
- Hutchins, J. (2001). *Machine Translation and Human Translation: In Competition or in Complementation*. *International Journal of Translation*. 13(2).  
<https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/1d01/c02e73c69c8985860340fe8ff9205aa11400.pdf>
- Iacovoni, A. (2009) *Translation by Omission*. Retrieved from <https://iacovoni.wordpress.com/2009/02/01/translation-by-omission/>.
- Jacquemound, R. (1992). *Translation and cultural hegemony: The case of French-Arabic translation*. London: Routledge.
- Lefevere, A. (1992). *Translation, rewriting, and the manipulation of literary fame*. London & New York: Routledge.

- Mahfouz, M. (1994). *Palace Walk* (Hutchins, W & Kenny, O Tans.) London: Transworld.
- Mehawesh, M. & Sadeq, A. (2014). Islamic Religious expressions in the Translation of Naguib Mahfouz Novel "The Beginning and the End". *Research on Humanities and Social Sciences*. 14(12),00
- Newmark, P. (1988). *A Textbook of translation*. New York: Prentice Hall
- Okour, R. (2008). *Machine Translation versus Human Translation with Reference to Pronouns: A Study of Agreement Errors in English-Arabic Texts*. Unpublished Master Thesis. Yarmouk University.
- Oxford University Press. (2019). *Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary*. Retrieved from <https://www.oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com/spellcheck/english/?q=a+small+piece+of+material+or+paper+that+you+use+for+blowing+your+nose%2C+etc>.
- Sager, J. (1994). *Language engineering and translation: Consequences of automation*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins.
- Salim, J & Mehawesh, M. (2013). Color Idiomatic Expressions in the Translation of Naguib Mahfouz's Novel "The Thief and the Dogs": A Case Study. *International Journal of English Linguistics*; 3(4), Canadian Center of Science and Education
- Somers, H. (2003). *Computer and translation: A translation guide*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins.

#### المصادر العربية

محفوظ، نجيب (2006). "بين القصرين". عمان: دار الشروق.